
FULL TEXT OF CASES (USPQ FIRST SERIES)

Ex parte Humber, Bruderlein, and Asselin, 217 USPQ 265 (BdPatApp&Int 1981)

Ex parte Humber, Bruderlein, and Asselin, 217 USPQ 265 (BdPatApp&Int 1981)

Ex parte Humber, Bruderlein, and Asselin

(BdPatApp&Int)

217 USPQ 265

Opinion dated Nov. 13, 1981

U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences

Headnotes

PATENTS

1. Patentability — Composition of matter — (§ 51.30)

Consistent with *In re Holladay*, 199 USPQ 516, applicants may show improved results for their claimed compounds in comparison with compounds that are even more closely related than those of prior art relied upon by Examiner in order to rebut prima facie case.

Particular patents — Chlorinated Compounds

Humber, Bruderlein, and Asselin, 13-Chloro-Benzocycloheptapyridoisoquinoline Derivatives and Process Therefor, rejection of claims 1-3 and 5-9 reversed.

Case History and Disposition:

Page 265

Appeal from Art Unit 122.

Application for patent of Leslie G. Humber, Francois T. Bruderlein, and Andre A. Asselin, Serial No. 817,660, filed July 21, 1977. From decision rejecting claims 1-3 and 5-9, applicants appeal (Appeal No. 443-29). Reversed.

Attorneys:

John W. Routh, New York, N.Y., for appellant.

Judge:

Before Blech and Goldstein, Examiners-in-Chief, and Seidleck, Acting Examiner-in-Chief.

Opinion Text

Opinion By:

Blech, Examiner-in-Chief.

This is an appeal from the final rejection of claims 1 through 3 and 5 through 9, all the claims remaining in the case.

Representatives of the claimed invention are:

1. A compound of formula 1

Tabular, graphic, or textual material set at this point is not available. Please consult hard copy or call BNA PLUS at 1-800-452-7773 or 202-452-4323.

in which R is lower alkyl selected from the group consisting of straight chain alkyl having up to six carbon atoms and branched chain alkyl having up to four carbon atoms or R is cycloalkyl having 3-6 carbon atoms, or a pharmaceutically acceptable acid addition salt thereof.

5. A method of producing neuroleptic effects in a mammal which comprises administering to said mammal an effective neuroleptic amount of a compound of Claim 1, or a pharmaceutically acceptable salt thereof.

6. A pharmaceutical composition for producing neuroleptic effects in a mammal comprising an effective neuroleptic amount of a compound of Claim 1, or a pharmaceutically acceptable salt thereof, and a pharmaceutically acceptable carrier.

The references cited by the Examiner are:

Table set at this point is not available. See table in hard copy or call BNA PLUS at 1-800-452-7773 or 202-452-4323.

Winthrop et al (Winthrop), J.O.C., 27, pp. 230-240, 1962.

Voith et al (Voith), Psychopharmacologia, 42, pp. 11-20, 1975.

Page 266

Humber et al (Humber II), Abstract of Papers, 167th ACS National Meeting, Los Angeles, Calif., March 31-April 5, 1974.

Bruderlein et al (Bruderlein II), J. Med. Chem., Vol. 18, pp. 185-188, 1975.

The appealed claims stand rejected for obviousness under 35 U.S.C. 103. The Examiner considers them to be unpatentable over Voith and Bruderlein II in view of Humber I and Winthrop.

The non-chlorinated analogs of the claimed compounds, specifically also of the preferred species wherein R in the formula above set forth is isopropyl (named "Butaclamol"), are known, as shown by Voith and Bruderlein II. It is the Examiner's position that the claimed 13-Cl substituted derivatives thereof would be prima facie obvious to the artisan in light of the teachings of Humber I and Winthrop and that this presumption of obviousness has not been adequately rebutted by the Declaration evidence

of record.

We cannot subscribe to the Examiner's holding. It is predicated on the assumption that chlorination, in general, is well known in the pharmaceutical art and since related compounds possessing neuroleptic properties are known to be useful in either their non-chlorinated or chlorinated forms that the claimed compounds are thus obvious. Such an assumption manifestly is bottomed on the proposition that the position in the molecule at which the chlorination occurs is inconsequential and of no significance. But such is contraindicated by the very art relied upon by the Examiner, as well as by the Voith Declaration under 37 CFR 1.132. Thus, from the teaching of Winthrop the artisan would favor the 14-Cl substituted compound inasmuch only its precursor is disclosed to have increased activity. The Voith Declaration, however, convincingly demonstrates unexpectedly significant improved results for the 13-chloro vis-a-vis the 9-Cl, 12-Cl and 14-Cl substituted compounds. Such clearly could not have been foreseen and rebuts the Examiner's basic premise of equivalency of chlorination no matter at which position it is effected.

[1] Of course we appreciate and are cognizant of the Examiner's contention that no improved results have been shown for the claimed chlorinated compounds vis-a-vis the non-chlorinated analog butaclamol. However, consistent with the holding by the court in *In re Holladay*, 584 F.2d 384, 199 USPQ 516 (CCPA 1978), appellants may show improved results for their claimed compounds in comparison with compounds which, in fact, are even closer related than those of the prior art relied upon by the Examiner in order to rebut the prima facie case. Consequently, the comparative showing vis-a-vis the other chlorinated compounds which are more similar to those claimed than the non-chlorinated derivatives is viable probative evidence which palpably must be held as refuting the presumption of obviousness engendered by the art.

Accordingly, the decision of the Examiner is reversed.

Reversed.

- End of Case -

Contact customer relations at: customer care@bna.com or 1-800-372-1033

ISSN 1526-8535

Copyright © 2005, The Bureau of National Affairs, Inc.
[Copyright FAQs](#) | [Internet Privacy Policy](#) | [BNA Accessibility Statement](#) | [License](#)

Reproduction or redistribution, in whole or in part, and in any form, without express written permission, is prohibited except as permitted by the BNA Copyright Policy. <http://www.bna.com/corp/index.html#V>
